

**BEFORE THE NATIONAL GREEN TRIBUNAL,
PRINCIPAL BENCH, NEW DELHI**

Original Application No. 21 of 2014

IN THE MATTER OF:

Vardhaman Kaushik Vs. Union of India & Ors.

**CORAM : HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE SWATANTER KUMAR, CHAIRPERSON
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE M.S. NAMBIAR, JUDICIAL MEMBER
HON'BLE DR. D.K. AGRAWAL, EXPERT MEMBER
HON'BLE PROF. A.R. YOUSUF, EXPERT MEMBER**

Present:

Applicant:	Mr. Sanjay Upadhyay, Adv. and Mr. Vardhman Kaushik, Applicant in person
Respondent No. 1:	Ms. Panchajanjya Batra Singh, Advocate, Dr. Rashid Hasan, Advisor and Mr. R.N. Jindal, Director
Respondent No. 2:	Ms. Alpana Poddar, Advocate
Respondent No. 4:	Mr. Narender Pal Singh, Adv. and Mr. Kulanand Joshi, Member Secy. Dr. S.D. Singh, CEO Parks and Garden Society Mr. Kush Sharma, Adv. for DDA Ms. Puja Kalra, Adv. for South and North MCD Ms. Savitri Pandey, Adv. Mr. Balendu Shekhar, Adv. for EDMC Mr. Sanjiv Verma, IAS, Director Environment Mr. P.C. Meena, IAS, Administrator, HUDA Mr. Mahavir Singh, HCS, Addl. Transport Commissioner Dr. Yadav, Chief Engineer, ULB Haryana Mr. Narender Hooda, Sr. Adv. and Mr. Dinesh Jindal, LO Ms. Bano Deswal, AAG Haryana Mr. Ardhendumauli Kumar Prasad, Adv. Mr. B.V. Niren and Prasouk Jain, Adv.

	Date and Remarks	Orders of the Tribunal
	Item No. 1, December 04, 2014 A	<p>It is undisputable and infact commonly conceded before us that Delhi is one of the worst cities as far as air pollution is concerned. Studies have shown that the air pollution of Delhi is very injurious to human health. Despite various Policies framed by the State and even some of the orders passed by the highest Court of the land the ambient air quality in Delhi is seriously violative of the prescribed standards. The extent of pollution has increased by the day causing varied illnesses to the citizenries of Delhi and even the</p>

morning walkers are not safe. In order to adopt a consultative and deliberated approach for resolving this serious menace the Tribunal had directed various stakeholders and all concerned Departments of the States to be present at a Chamber meeting that was held at NGT on 02nd December, 2014. Amongst others the following were present:-

1. Dr. S. C. Khuntia, Special Secretary & Financial Advisor, Ministry of Petroleum and Natural Gas
2. Dr. Rashid Hasan, Advisor, MoEF & CC
3. Mr. A. B. Akolkar, Member Secretary, Central Pollution Control Board
4. Mr. Sanjiv Kumar, Secretary, Environment & Forest, NCT of Delhi
5. Ms. Alka Diwan, Secretary Finance, GNCTD, Finance Deptt.
6. Mr. Satish Mathur, SPL Commissioner (Transport), GNCTD
7. Mr. P C Meena, IAS, HUDA
8. Mr. M. K. Meena, IPS, Jt. CP, New Delhi, Delhi Police
9. Dr. M. M. Kully, Member Secretary, Finance, GNCTD
10. Dr. Mukesh Chander, Special Commissioner Incharge Traffic Police Delhi, Delhi Police
11. Mr. P. Kamaraj, Spl. CP/HQ, Delhi
12. Dr. Anil Kumar, Director (Environment), Govt. of Delhi, Environment Dept., Govt. of Delhi
13. Mr. Kulanand Joshi, Member Secretary, Delhi Pollution Control Committee, Govt. of NCT of

		Delhi
		14. Mr. Praveen Gupta, Commissioner, Nr. DMC, MCD (North)
		15. Mr. Manish Gupta, Commissioner, SDMC, EDMC
		16. Mr. Gyanesh Bhati, Secretary Cum Commissioner Transport, Govt. of NCT of Delhi
		17. Mr. Debanshu Mukherjee, CMD, Delhi Transport corporation
		18. Mr. SCL Das, Secretary (Health), Govt. of NCT of Delhi
		19. Mr. Sanjay Bandopadhyaya, Joint Secretary, Ministry of Road Transport & Highways
		20. Ms. Durga Shanker Mishra, Addl. Secretary, Ministry of Urban Development
		21. Mr. Pramod Kumar Agrawal, ACEO, NOIDA
		22. Mr. Anant Kumar, CE, New Delhi Municipal Council
		23. Mr. Deepak Gupta, CE, PWD, GMCTD
		24. Mr. C. Ekambaram, Chief Engineer, M/o Road Transport Highways
		25. Dr. TK Joshi, Delhi Govt. MAML
		26. Ms. Puja Kalra, Adv., Counsel for North MCD, South MCD
		27. Ms. Savitri Pandey, Adv., Counsel for State of U.P.
		28. Mr. Ravindra Kumar, Adv., NOIDA
		29. Mr. Surnedra Kumar, Law Officer, South MCD, South MCD
		30. MR. Balendu Shekhar, Adv. Of EDMC, EDMC
		31. Mr. Kush Sharma, Adv., Delhi Development Authority

32. Mr. Narender Pal Singh, Adv. For DPCC & GNCTD
33. Mr. Dinesh Jindal, Law Officer, DPCC
34. Dr. M.P. George, Scientist-D, Delhi Pollution Control Committee

Reference to various proposals put forward by the various studies carried out by different Departments and preventive and restorative steps that could be taken were deliberated upon extensively. Further, it was also discussed as to how effectively the directions issued by the Tribunal could be implemented effectively and purposefully. There was a serious concern and consensus that the air quality of Delhi needed attention of all concerned and had to be improved, even if necessary by taking harsh steps in accordance with law.

The studies have shown that there are three primary sources causing serious air pollution in NCR Delhi as far as PM10 is concerned. They are dust, burning of plastic and other materials including leaves in the open area and vehicular pollution. All these three sources lead to a common evil of air pollution by introducing high particulate matters, hydrocarbon, oxides of sulphur and nitrogen, benzene and ozone in the air. Vehicles emit numerous carcinogenic chemicals, diesel contains benzene, formaldehyde and 1, 3 – butadiene all three are well recognised carcinogenics. All these pollutants are responsible for causing health hazards. Burning of material also causes serious respiratory problems and are even carcinogenic. It is unquestionable that citizens of Delhi are certainly

entitled to better quality of air and environment. Though, these three sources of pollution are independent of each other and require different and distinct preventive and restorative directions, but have to be dealt with a common object of ensuring attainment of better ambient air quality in NCR Delhi.

This necessitated the issuance of Notice to the State of Haryana, State of Uttar Pradesh and State of Rajasthan which have adjacent border with NCR Delhi. Learned counsel appearing for these States have accepted Notice and are present before the Tribunal. They also commonly conceded that adequate measures are required to be taken for prevention and control of pollution and maintenance of air quality. They also further state that all these States would fully cooperate with the Government of NCT of Delhi and would comply with the directions of the Tribunal for attainment of the object aforesaid.

An argument has been advanced before us to say that banning of 15 years old vehicles in Delhi would be unfair to the owners of the cars and consequently if cars are sent outside Delhi it would mean that they will cause pollution in other cities and hence, it would shift the pollution. This submission is not only misconceived but void of reasoning as well. Foremost, it pre-supposes that the vehicles of more than 15 years age are not causing pollution. The direction for not permitting the 15 years old vehicles to ply in Delhi may cause some hardship but certainly that hardship on individual or group of individuals must give way to the public cause

of better environment and public health, which as per constitutional mandate is the fundamental right of the public at large. Individual rights must concede in favour of public rights.

Furthermore a 15 year old vehicle may have greater adverse impact on the air quality and environment in a congested area with heavy vehicles density in comparison to when it is driven in an area which is open, with thin vehicle density has a greener belt and wider air dispersion possibility. It is an established fact that particulate problem is most severe in the area having dense population coupled with heavy traffic intensity. Although new engine design have come into existence to reduce emission but the gain has got over shadowed the increasing number of vehicles and the increasing miles travelled per vehicle per year (Wargo et al 2006; Environment and Human Health Inc. Connecticut, USA) with heavy engine. We have to give precedence to the environment and public health and, therefore, the directions must be adhered to without delay and default. Having considered various aspects and after seriously pondering over the suggestions made at the Bar or in the Chamber meeting, we are of the considered view that further directions are called for in the larger public interest and to ensure prevention of air pollution emanating from the three primary sources aforestated.

It has also been brought to our notice that nearly 30 lakhs litres of petrol is wasted because of traffic jams and held-up-at signals. This data, however, relates to

the year 2009 which must naturally have increased considerably now. There are certain definite steps that required to be taken by the concerned Authorities to ensure free flow of traffic and avoid traffic congestion on the roads.

Directions:

1. Our order dated 26th November, 2014 and 28th November, 2014 shall continue to be in force till further orders and shall be strictly enforced by all concerned Authorities.
2. We direct a team of CPCB, DPCC, a Scientist from MoEF, a Scientist from State Boards of State of Rajasthan, State of Haryana and State of Uttar Pradesh to take ambient air quality samples from the entire NCR Delhi at different intervals and times. The samples would be taken during the peak hours as well as non-peak hours. The sample shall definitely be collected in the early morning hours and late evening hours. The complete analysis of this data for all parameters of NAAQS 2006 shall be made and comparison with the national ambient air quality specified in the Notification dated 18th November, 2009 issued by the MoEF in relation to the air quality standards specified therein shall be made. This report shall also identify the environmentally safest period of the day when residents of Delhi would be exposed to minimum injury to their health.

3. The data so collected shall be treated as base line data for issuance of further directions to improve air quality in Delhi. As already indicated these three principle sources of pollution of air have to be separately dealt with. There cannot be any commonality in the issuance of directions and measures to be taken for prevention and control under each head. Thus, we would pass directions specific to each of the above stated sources:

Vehicular Pollution

1. In addition to the directions already issued we further direct concerned Authorities and Administration to consider the proposal for charging of higher parking fee, higher registration fee and imposition of congestion charges. They shall put their respective suggestions on record before the next date of hearing.

2. We direct all the State Governments, particularly NCT Delhi, to take effective steps to enhance public transportation facilities and provide due infrastructure in that behalf. It will be ensured that public transport becomes more user friendly rather than causing waste of energy by plying empty buses on the roads.

It is a matter of common knowledge that air conditioned buses are being run by DTC for long part of the day ply but without passengers. Thus, DTC should run buses of different capacity and

		<p>size at different timings and on different routes.</p> <p>All such buses would be driven on CNG fuel only.</p> <p>3. The DTC shall ensure that the buses running by it do not cause congestion. This transport should be of greater utility to the public and distinct incentives should be provided to the general public to encourage use of public transport.</p> <p>4. The DTC shall ensure that every bus belonging to DTC or operating under its directions is subjected to mechanical check up through computerised system once every month and will be subjected to check for PUC atleast twice a month.</p> <p>5. The DTC shall formulate a proper group of staff to carry out above directions/functions and submit a compliance report to the Depot Manager who in turn will inform the highest Authority of the DTC. The above regular computerised check will not absolve the DTC from being subjected to random checks by the concerned Authorities for the purposes of issuance of PUC. It shall be ensured that these buses do not exceed the prescribed emissions standard.</p> <p>6. The Government and all concerned Authorities shall ensure free flow of traffic in Delhi. Parking spaces shall be earmarked. Parking of vehicles in excess and beyond the specified parking area shall be strictly prohibited. In any case, there shall be no parking permitted on metalled roads in Delhi and appropriate Authority shall take due steps for taking penal action against the</p>
--	--	--

defaulting persons or firms or contractors who violate this direction.

General directions

1. Obstructions in free flow of traffic result in traffic jams that lead to higher emission of pollutants in the atmosphere. Thus, we direct the Authorities to ensure that there is no unauthorised parking and whenever a vehicle breaks down on the roads, the same should be removed immediately and without any undue delay. Authorities particularly the Police, thus should make the towing cranes easily accessible.
2. The persons who violate these directions besides being liable for different actions that may be taken against them by the Corporation or appropriate Authority under the law in force, would also be liable to pay compensation and the amounts may be determined by the Tribunal on the principle of 'Polluter Pays' for causing and/or abating pollution in NCR Delhi.
3. The ambient air quality of Delhi needs to be improved even if harsh directions within the framework of law are required to be issued. Keeping in view the gravity of harm to human health due to inferior ambient air quality of Delhi. Improvement even by a decimal of the air quality would go long way in air improving public health and environment in Delhi. Thus, we direct the Governments and all public and other Authorities to immediately install air filters in the colleges,

		<p>schools, gardens and other public places which are visited by a greater number of people in the day.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none">4. The check post, as directed earlier at the entry points to Delhi, would be manned and monitored commonly by Police, transport department and Weight and Measures Department of NCT of Delhi, and also Officers of the similar Department from the concerned States shall accompany.5. Online weighing machines shall be installed at a short distance away from the entry post of Delhi. Record of online data of weighing machines in respect of goods carrying vehicles would be maintained regularly and checked by the senior Officer of Police and Transport Department who shall sign and verify such data every day.6. The check post would only let such vehicles pass onwards which are found to be neither overloaded nor polluting.7. These Check Post Staff shall make all efforts to ensure that there is no congestion at the entry points of Delhi and no vehicle standing at the Border should be allowed to keep its ignition on.8. The concerned Authorities and Government should take steps to ensure expeditious completion of the project of Kundli-Manesar-Palwal Express Way, which we are informed is likely to be completed by 2016. The completion of the projects would ensure that the vehicular traffic for destinations other than Delhi do not
--	--	---

		<p>enter NCR Delhi, thus, reducing traffic pressure and consequently air pollution, resulting from vehicular traffic in Delhi.</p> <p>9. We also direct NCT Delhi and DDA particularly to take the project for completion of a flyway and/or to connect all existing flyovers without obstruction and traffic lights on top priority.</p> <p>10. The authorities concerned of all the States and NCR of Delhi shall also ensure that Eastern Peripheral Express Way should be completed in a time bound manner and the project be taken up with top priority by the concerned States.</p> <p>11. We direct that the DPCC and the Transport Department shall immediately ensure installation of appropriate 'catalytic convertors', particularly for diesel vehicles, if not already fitted which would ensure reduction of pollutants entering the atmosphere in Delhi.</p> <p>12. The Government of NCT will take steps to introduce and enforce BS-V vehicles in NCR Delhi. All other neighbouring States would ensure that they also take effective steps to have BS – IV compliant vehicles only. The progress report should be submitted before the next date of hearing to the Tribunal.</p> <p>13. It was agreed and which we direct that Lajpat Nagar and Karol Bagh should be taken as pilot projects for de-congestion of the traffic resulting from excessive and impermissible parking in the entire area.</p>
--	--	--

		<p>14. We direct Transport Authority, Delhi Police and DPCC to take immediate and effective steps so that parking areas are marked distinctly and no vehicle is permitted to be parked beyond parking areas in Lajpat Nagar and Karol Bagh. It will be ensured that free flow of traffic is maintained in the market and colonies of the pilot projects. In Lajpat Nagar two way dual carriage while in Karol Bagh one way dual carriage flow of traffic shall be maintained. There must not be any parking on the metalled roads. The concerned Police Officers, Officers of the Corporation and other agencies/authorities shall be personally responsible for this compliance.</p> <p>15. It has been brought to our notice that the forest area of Delhi is 12.12% as against national forest policy that envisaged 33% forest area. However, it may also be noticed that if the green area is added along with forest area then it may come to nearly 20.08% and from whatever point it is viewed, Delhi certainly needs a larger green area and forest cover. Thus, we direct NCR of Delhi, DPCC and Forest Department to increase the forest cover area as well as to maintain the existing green and forest covers in an appropriate manner and ensure that there is no degradation of the forest and/or green area in Delhi.</p> <p>16. The Forest Department shall submit report before us as to how many trees have been planted from today till the next date of hearing. The Forest</p>
--	--	--

		<p>Department and Corporation should plant variety of trees belonging to native species in the existing open forest area and also, along the roads and other open spaces.</p> <p>17. It has not been disputed that checking of vehicles and grant of PUC in the entire NCR of Delhi lacks proper functioning and supervision. Thus, we direct all the States to constitute a special team consisting of members from its Transport Department, Environment Department, Pollution Boards and from any other Department as they may consider appropriate to keep serious vigil on the functioning of the service stations or centers empowered to issue PUC. It will ensure that their machines and equipments are duly calibrated on regular intervals and PUC are issued only after checking vehicles in accordance with the norms specified.</p> <p>18. It has also been seriously deliberated that garbage burning in Delhi may not be the only pollutant but it is most serious pollutant. It causes nearly 29.4% of air pollution with reference to PM10, however, its contribution in terms of pm 2.5 is not placed us which is a serious pollutant and causes health hazards. Therefore, steps should be taken to reduce level of PM 2.5 through appropriate anti pollution devices.</p> <p>19. The only workable solution to this serious menace is complete prohibition on burning of garbage or other material in the open area.</p>
--	--	---

		<p>20. It has also been brought to the notice of the Tribunal that waste plastic, rubber and materials are burnt openly though prohibitory orders have been issued in the other connected matters by the Tribunal. The police has reported that no such burning is going on particularly in the area of Narela and Mundka but complaints with photographs are still being filed before the Tribunal stating clear violation of this direction.</p> <p>21. Thus, we direct Police Authority and respective Municipal Corporation and the DPCC to ensure that any waste material, garbage or even leaves are not burnt in the open areas at all. For this purpose, concerned Executive Engineer of the respective organisation responsible for activities of cleanliness shall be personally responsible because this work alone cannot be carried out by the Police with its limited resources. It is important that all the public Authorities including DPCC and the representative of the State Boards effectively supervise the compliance of this direction. If any person is found to be causing such pollution then besides the actions that can be taken against him. We make it clear that such person shall be liable to pay compensation in terms of Section 15 of the National Green Tribunal Act, 2010 under the principle of 'polluter pays'. This compensation may vary depending on facts and circumstances of the case from Rs. 20,000 to Rs. 1 lakh per incident.</p>
--	--	--

22. Proper steps will be taken to spread education through different sources and even by requiring concerned Schools in the NCR, Delhi to educate students about the need for improvement of air quality and the steps that should be taken. Cooperation of the young generation should be encouraged besides providing a good incentives to the people reporting the same and steps be taken for creating environmental wings in the Capital city of India.

23. Suggestions have been made with regard to putting of cap on total number the vehicles, including cars and all other vehicles. We direct all the concerned Authorities in the respective States to collectively put their views before next date of hearing in this regard.

24. We further direct that there shall be no hot mixing on the road side. All public Authorities particularly the PWD, DDA and others should themselves, during construction and maintenance of road, ensure that coal tar, bitumen and/or asphalt mix is brought in molten condition and the same is neither burnt nor fire is put to melt these substance on the open roads.

25. The NCR Delhi, DDA and Railway Boards shall consider shifting and /or bifurcating of three sites meant for Cargo containers i.e. Tughlakabad, Okhla and area close to Anand Vihar, where heavy containers depot have been

located, 10 or 12 wheeler heavy trailers come to these areas and thus, cause serious traffic jams obstructing free flow of traffic, besides directly causing pollution in the air. If these sites are shifted or bifurcated atleast in the areas in the outskirts of NCR in consultation with the other States will help greatly in improving the air quality of NCR Delhi.

26. A suggestion was also made to fix life of the vehicle especially private and commercial.

27. Now we will be dealing with the air pollution from dust. It primarily results from demolition and construction activity going on in the NCR Delhi. Furthermore, the demolition material and construction material are transported without proper coverage and precautions, thus causing serious air pollution. It is informed that the largest contributor of air pollution is dust in NCR Delhi. This needs to be resolved at the earliest. It is also commonly conceded before us that this is one aspect which can be controlled by taking adequate measures without posing much difficulties. Still it is imperative that there should be definite will and sincerity for complying with the directions contained in this order on the part of all concerned. Hoping that all the concerned Departments of the Government, Police Authorities and Corporation would earnestly execute the directions, we issue following directions:

		<p>1) No government, authority, contractor, builders or any person would be permitted to store/dump construction material or debris on the metalled road.</p> <p>2) Beyond the metalled road the area where such construction material or debris can be stored shall be physically demarcated by the Officers of all the concerned Authorities/Corporation. It shall be ensured that such storage does not cause any obstruction to the free flow of traffic and/or inconvenience to the pedestrians. It should be ensured that no accidents occur on account of such permissible storage. Every builder, contractor or person shall ensure that the construction material is completely covered by tarpaulin. All other precautions should be taken to ensure that no dust particles are permitted to pollute the air quality as a result of such storage. It shall also be ensured that appropriate protection measures are taken by raising of wind breakers of the appropriate height on all the sides of plot/area using plastic and/or other similar material, to ensure that no construction material dust fly outside the plot area and it will be the builder/contractor responsibility to ensure that their activity does not cause any air pollution during the course of the construction and/ or storage of material or construction activity. This condition shall be strictly</p>
--	--	--

adhered to by every builder, contractor, person or authority whether it relates to construction on small plot or a multistoreyed building. In the event of default they shall be liable to be prosecuted under the law in force, as well as for causing environmental pollution and shall also be liable to pay compensation which would be determined by the Tribunal in accordance with law.

3) All the concerned State Pollution Control Boards and environment departments of the State are hereby directed to maintain strict vigil and supervision over all the stone crushers to ensure that they are operating only after obtaining consent of the board/authority and are strictly conforming to the prescribed norms.

4) The Executive Engineer of each PWD or any other organisation would be personally responsible for effective compliance of these directions who shall submit Report to his Chief Engineer without delay and default every week. This will also apply to construction of all the roads, highways in the NCR Delhi.

5) All the trucks or vehicles of any kind which are used for construction purposes and/or are carrying construction materials like cement, sand and other allied material shall be fully covered. The vehicles would be properly cleaned, shall be dust free and/or other

precautions would be taken to ensure that enroute their destinations, the dust, sand or other particles are not permitted to be released in the air and/or contaminate air. Any truck which is not complying with these directions would not be permitted to enter NCR Delhi.

6) All Authorities, Corporations of NCR Delhi shall also ensure that there will no burning of any material earmarked at the land fill sites.

7) Crop remnant burning in agricultural field falling in NCR Delhi shall be strictly prohibited.

8) All the authorities i.e. Chief Secretaries, of the respective States and NCR Delhi, Commissioner / DGP, heads of all the public authorities, bodies, organization, including the Director General of PWD, CPWD, Horticulture Department, Vice Chairman of DDA, Commissioner of the respective Corporation, Chairperson of State Pollution Control Board and all Authorities, shall issue directions forthwith for strict compliance of these directions and in default would take disciplinary action under the respective service rules for any of the breach committed by officials to the direction aforestated.

9) We also direct the inspecting team to collect stack and air ambient quality samples from and near the Indraprastha Thermal Power Station Delhi and

Barder Pur Thermal Power Plant. They should specifically provide information to contribution of these two plants to the air pollution in Delhi.

The above directions shall be enforced without delay and default by all the concerned Authorities, Corporation, DDA, DJB, Forest Department, Department of Environment, NCT Delhi, DPCC, Department of Weights and Measures, NCT Delhi and Police Force. The head of the Department of all these would be personally responsible for compliance of these directions. It is further made clear that the head of Departments shall fix responsibility of all the Officers incharge of different areas to ensure that directions are carried out without default and delay.

All the status reports, compliance of which is required above as per directions of this Tribunal would be filed before the Tribunal three days in advance of the date fixed.

Liberty is granted to all the parties, any person aggrieved or otherwise and all the Departments to approach the Tribunal if the occasions so arises for clarification of the orders passed by the Tribunal and/or for issuing further directions.

List this matter on 12th January, 2015 the date already fixed.

.....,CP
(Swatanter Kumar)

		<p>.....,JM (M.S. Nambiar)</p> <p>.....,EM (Dr. D.K. Agrawal)</p> <p>.....,EM (Prof. A.R. Yousuf)</p>
--	--	---

